



Partial Replacement of Fish Meal with Blood Meal in Diets of *Clarias gariepinus* (Pisces: Clariidae) Fingerlings in Mubi, Nigeria: Effects on Growth, Survival and Cost

*Duwal, S.D¹., Onyia, L.U²., Edward, A¹., Apollos, T.G¹., George, M¹. and Kwankwa, T³.

¹Department of Fisheries and Aquaculture, Adamawa State University, Mubi, Nigeria.

²Department of Fisheries, Modibbo Adama University of Technology, Yola, Nigeria.

³Department of Fisheries Technology, The Federal Polytechnic, Mubi, Nigeria.

*Contact: dagdigal@yahoo.com; +2348059210272

Abstract

The research was designed to determine the effects of partial replacement of fishmeal with blood meal on the growth and survival of Clarias gariepinus fingerlings in Mubi, Nigeria. The experiment was conducted at the Department of Fisheries and Aquaculture, Adamawa State University, Mubi, Nigeria, using the test diets D1=BM100% + FM0%, D2=BM75% + FM25%, D3=BM50% + FM50%, D4=BM25% + FM75% and D5=BM0% + FM100%. Each diet was fed to 60 fingerlings replicated into 3 (20 per tank). Growth performances were obtained using weight gain, length gain, Specific Growth Rate SGR and Feed Conversion Ratio FCR and survival rate. Weight gain was best in D5 (207.48 \pm 48.1) and least in D3 125.45 \pm 48.1, the best length gain was recorded in D5 (1.46 \pm 0.17) and least in D3 (0.55 ± 0.17) , the best Feed Conversion Ratio was found in D2 (1.81 ± 0.38) and least in D4 (0.70 ± 0.38) , Specific Growth Ratio was best in D5 (4.71±2.51) and least in D3 (2.85±2.51) and the highest survival was in D1 (81.67 ± 10.6) and lowest in D3 (55.00 ± 10.8) . Water quality parameters were also observed with pH ranging from $(8.23\pm0.07 - 8.78\pm0.07)$, temperature $(16.13\pm3.41 - 18.50\pm3.41)$, D.O $(5.53\pm0.04 - 6.03\pm0.04)$ and finally Ammonia $(0.16.0.08 - 0.17 \pm 0.08)$. The cost benefit of this research indicated that D1 was the cheapest while D5 was the most expensive. It was concluded that blood meal is a suitable protein source which can be used in the diets of C. gariepinus because of the significant differences observed in the diets. It is therefore recommended that fish farmers use Blood meal to partially or completely replace fish meal in C. gariepinus diets. Further studies to determine the long term effect on the performance of fish fed the fish meal replacement diet is suggested.

Keywords: Partial Replacement; Fish meal; Blood meal; Growth; Survival; Clarias gariepinus.

Introduction

There are continues effort on the replacement of the more expensive protein concentrates mainly fish meal in animal diets with cheaper and less competitive demanded feeding resources (Dongmo *et al.*,2000). In recent years, many researchers have tried different kind of animal meal (bone meal, blood meal, hemoglobin meal, poultry meal, and meat meal) to substitute fish meal in diets and the percentage of substitution has varied according to species, fish size and feeding habits (Zhou *et al.*, 2004; Barnes *et al.*, 2012). Before now, the alternative raw materials were selected for feed formulation because they were less expensive and more available than fish meal and fish oil, but it is

currently also necessary to consider raw materials with an adequate balance in amino acid profile, good digestibility, high level protein content, and a suitable palatability as good protein sources in fish diets (Lunger *et al.*, 2007; Antolović *et al.*, 2012; Bayraktar and Bayır 2012). Fish is a rich source of animal protein throughout the world. Due to its nutritional value (Tingman *et al.*, 2010), the demand for fish food has been on the increase with increasing human population (FAO, 2010; 2012). Fish culture which is an important source of protein and employment for many people has been used to bridge the gap between demand and supply of fish from capture fisheries. Nonconventional protein sources are becoming better alternative to high cost feeds. Blood meal, a common sustainable source of animal protein, has not been successfully utilized as a wholesale substitute for fish meal in catfish feeds due to observed deficiencies (Otubusin *et al.*, 2009). Documented deficiencies include poor amino acids balance with lysine being relatively high (7-8%) and isoleucine being very low (Sauvant, 2004). The study is therefore aimed at determining the effects of partial replacement of fish meal with blood meal on the growth and survival of *Clarias gariepinus* fingerlings.

Materials and Methods

Experimental site

The experiment was carried out in the Department of Fisheries and Aquaculture Complex, Adamawa State University (ADSU) Mubi. Mubi is located on latitude 10°27" and longitude 13°27".

Feed formulation

Five Diets (D1-D5) with different levels of fish meal and blood meal inclusion and other feed ingredients with 40% crude protein was formulated using Trial and Error Method.

Feed preparation

Blood meal was collected from Mubi abattoir and processed. It was sundried and ground to powdered form. The other ingredients were purchased from Mubi market. All of these ingredients were ground to powdered form except soya bean which was first toasted in order to treat the anti-nutrient factor. Each feed composition was weighed out and then mixed thoroughly (see Table 1). It was pelleted after it was moistened, Starch was added to improve the binding capacity. The feed was sundried and packaged before feeding trial began.

Experimental design and feeding

Three hundred (300) - 6 weeks old *C. gariepinus* fingerlings was obtained from Yola, which was used for the trials. 60 fingerlings were stocked into 3 experimental tanks as replicate to each diet. A total of 15 replicates, 3 for each diet was used. The fish was fed once daily with the formulated feed which contained different levels of blood meal and fish meal at 5% body weight. The feed was administered

Duwal, et al., ADSUJSR, 7(1):1-7, April, 2019

between 8 to 9 am and 5 to 6 pm daily for the period of 6 weeks.

Cost Benefit Analysis of Formulated Diets

The cost of all the feed ingredients used in the different diets, (D1-D5) was obtained in the course of the experiment as follows:

- i) Cost of each ingredient.
- ii) Cost of ingredients per/kg.
- iii) Total cost of feed.

Data collection

The fish in each treatment were weighed at the commencement of the feeding trial and at every two weeks, using a sensitive scale Mettler Balance Model P1210. Ration allotment was adjusted bi-weekly according to the new body weight changes. Uneaten food and faecal samples were siphoned out daily while fish mortality was also monitored. Body weight changes and feed intake were recorded every two weeks while feed conversion ratio was computed according to Burel et al. (2000). At the end of 6 weeks trial, the fish in each tank were weighed to determine the final weight. Water quality parameters such as pH, temperature and dissolved Oxygen and Ammonia were monitored in situ daily throughout the duration of experiment using the methods of Duwal (2016) to ensure water quality standards. The following data were collected and recorded;

a) Growth performances

i) % Weight gain = $\frac{Wf - Wi}{Wi} \times 100$

Where Wf = mean final body weight of fish

Wi = mean Initial body weight of fish ((Duwal, 2016).

ii) Specific Growth Rate (SGR)

$$SGR = \frac{100(lnW2 - lnW1)}{T1 - T0}$$

 $Ln = Natural \log$

 W_2 = mean final body weight of fish

 W_1 = mean initial body weight of fish

 $T_1 =$ final time (in days)

 $T_0 =$ Initial time (in days) (Falayi, 2009)

b. Feed Utilization Analysis

i. Food intake/day = total unit of feed consumed total No. of days (Adikwu, 2003)

ii.	Feed	Conversion	Ratio	(FCR)	=
Feed	Fed (Dry	weight)g			
W	'eight gai	ned g			

c. Water quality parameters

The water quality parameters analyzed in this experiment were Temperature, pH, Dissolved oxygen and Ammonia which were determined *in situ* daily using mercury in glass bulb thermometer, Jenway 3020 pH meter and Milwaukee Dissolved Oxygen Meter (MW 600) respectively. Results of water quality parameters are recorded in Table 3.

Duwal, et al., ADSUJSR, 7(1):1-7, April, 2019

Statistical Analysis

The data were subjected to Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) and Least Significant Difference was used to separate the means at 5% probability (Microsoft Excel, 2013)

Results

Feed composition

Diets with various inclusion levels of blood meal and fish meal were formulated as follows presented in Table 1.

Table 1 Ingredients	Composition	of Tests Diets	(Drv weight)
- asie - ingreatenes	000000000000000000000000000000000000000		

	-			-	
Ingredients	D1	D2	D3	D4	D5
Blood meal	(100%)1.0	(75%)0.9	(50%)0.55	(25%)0.3	-
Fish meal	-	(25%)0.3	(50%)0.6	(75%)1.0	(100)1.3
Maize	0.3	0.3	0.3	0.3	0.2
Maize offal	0.6	0.6	0.45	0.4	0.35
Soya beans	0.6	0.4	0.6	0.5	0.65
Premix	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1
Palm oil	0.2	0.2	0.2	0.2	0.2
Salt	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1
Starch	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1
Total	3kg	3kg	3kg	3kg	3kg

Growth Performances

From the result presented in Table 2, the highest weight gained was recorded in D5 (100% FM) while D3 (50% BM and FM) gave the lowest weight gained. Correspondingly D5 gave the highest length gain while D3 gave the lowest. The highest FCR was recorded in D2 (75% BM and 25% FM) while the lowest FCR was recorded in D4 (25% BM and 75% FM) and lastly the highest survival was recorded in D1 (100% BM) and the lowest in D4.

Water Quality

Throughout the experimental days (44), the pH ranged from $(8.78\pm0.07-8.23\pm0.07)$, Temperature $(18.50\pm3.41-16.13\pm3.41)$, D.O from $(6.03\pm5.53\pm0.04)$ and lastly Ammonia from $(0.17\pm0.08-0.16\pm0.08)$ respectively. This is seen in Table 3.

Cost Benefit Result

The result of the cost benefit analysis is present in table 4 below. It was observed that D5 was the highest while D1 was the lowest.

			Diets			
Parameters	D_1	D_2	D_3	D_4	D ₅	L.S.D
Initial weight (g)	33.56±12 ^a	37.43±12 ^a	34.35±12 ^a	30.06±12 ^b	31.35±12 ^b	6.43
Final weight (g)	$232.84{\pm}65.1^{a}$	210.13±65.1 ^b	$148.17 \pm 65.1^{\circ}$	145.27±65.1 ^c	238.83±65.1 ^a	147.42
Weight gained (g)	199.27 ± 48.1^{b}	172.70±48.1 ^b	125.45±48.1°	$126.28 \pm 48.1^{\circ}$	207.48 ± 48.1^{a}	126.88
Initial length (cm)	6.80 ± 0.16^{b}	6.89 ± 0.16^{b}	7.18 ± 0.16^{a}	6.91 ± 0.16^{b}	6.84 ± 0.16^{b}	0.74
Final length (cm)	7.58 ± 8.13^{b}	7.73 ± 1.8^{b}	5.23±1.8°	$5.14{\pm}1.8^{\circ}$	$8.30{\pm}1.8^{a}$	5.19
length gained (cm)	0.78 ± 8.13^{b}	0.84 ± 0.17^{b}	$0.55 \pm 0.17^{\circ}$	$0.61 \pm 0.17^{\circ}$	1.46 ± 0.17^{a}	0.75
S.G.R	4.52 ± 2.51^{a}	3.92 ± 2.51^{b}	$2.85 \pm 2.51^{\circ}$	$2.87 \pm 2.51^{\circ}$	4.71±2.51 ^a	2.88
F.I	10.00 ± 0.00^{a}	10.00±0.00 ^a	10.00 ± 0.00^{a}	10.00 ± 0.00^{a}	10.00 ± 0.00^{a}	0.00
F.C.R	1.57 ± 0.38^{b}	1.81 ± 0.38^{a}	1.16 ± 0.38^{a}	0.70 ± 0.38^{d}	$1.13\pm0.38^{\circ}$	1.13
% Mortality	18.33 ± 10.6^{d}	31.67 ± 10.6^{b}	$45.00{\pm}10.6^{a}$	41.67 ± 10.6^{a}	$25.00{\pm}10.6^{\circ}$	59.37
% Survival	81.67 ± 10.6^{a}	68.33±10.6 ^c	55.00 ± 10.6^{d}	58.33±10.6 ^d	75.00±10.6 ^b	59.37

Table 2: Growth parameters of Clarias gareipinus fed with different diets

Mean in the same row having the same superscript do not differ significantly (P < 0.05) **Note:** S.G.R= Specific Growth Rate; F.I = Feed Intake; F.C.R Feed Conversion Ratio

Table 3: Water Quality Parameters

Water Qualit	у		Diets			
Parameters	D_1	D_2	D_3	D_4	D_5	L.S.D
pH	8.78 ± 0.07^{a}	8.55 ± 0.07^{a}	8.53 ± 0.07^{a}	$8.77\pm^{a}$	8.23 ± 0.07^{b}	0.49
D.O mg/L	5.63±0.04 ^b	5.73±0.04 ^b	6.03 ± 0.04^{a}	5.53±0.04 ^b	5.67±0.04 ^b	0.30
Ammonia mg/L	$0.17{\pm}0.08^{a}$	0.16 ± 0.08^{b}	0.16 ± 0.08^{b}	0.16 ± 0.08^{b}	0.16 ± 0.08^{b}	0.52
Temperature (°C)	18.50±3.41 ^a	16.13±3.41°	16.73±3.41°	16.22±3.41 ^c	17.13 ± 3.41^{b}	3.36

Mean in the same row having the same superscript do not differ significantly (P<0.05)

	Co	st of in	gredient	s(N)					
	BM	FM	SBM	Μ	MO	Qty(kg)	Expenses(N)	T.cost(₦)	1kg/ N
D1	0	0	100	70	15	3	100	285	95.00
D2	0	75	80	70	15	3	100	340	113.33
D3	0	150	100	70	20	3	100	440	146.67
D4	0	175	90	70	19	3	100	454	151.33
D5	0	220	110	70	17	3	100	507	169.00

Table 4: Cost Analysis for Feed Production

Where: BM = Blood meal

FM = Fish Meal

SBM = soybean meal

M = whole maize

MO= maize offal

Cost implication of the replacement was analysed, the cost analysis of the five diet showed that D1 (100% blood meal) was the cheapest (N95/kg) among the five dietary treatments, followed by D2, D3, D4 and finally diet D5 the most expensive (N169/kg). The Oil and Mineral/Vitamin premix in each of the dietary treatment are of the same quantity. It is therefore negligible in the cost analysis of the five diets.

Discussion

The use of Blood meal has been part of strategies to reduce cost of feeding fish. The result from Table 1 indicates that fish meal can be replaced by several sources of protein like Blood meal. All diets (D1-D5) were successfully compounded and pelleted. Dominy and Ako (1988) reported that Blood meal products can replace marine proteins in grow-out rations for medium sized (3.4 g) Pannaeus vannamei. In the long term feeding trials (120 days) of Otubisin (2009) with caged reared Oreochromis niloticus fingerlings using blood meal as a fish meal replacer, it was found that dietary Blood meal inclusion levels above 50% of the fish meal protein significantly reduced fish performance. In this experiment opposite is the case, the diet with 100% inclusion level of blood meal, significantly improved C. gariepinus fingerlings performance despite some limiting factors such as much haemoglobin concentration in the water, feeding rates and frequency, rearing condition and other environmental factors. The result in Table 2 summarize the growth performance of C. gariepinus fingerlings. D5 gave the highest weight gain of 207.48±48.1 which was significantly different from D1, D2 (199.27±48.1, 172.70±48.1) and D3,D4 (125.45±48.1, 126.28±48.1). Agbebi et al. (2009) reported that fish meal can be replaced completely (100%) by blood meal with no adverse effect on growth, survival and feed conversion of C. gariepinus juvenile. Their result corroborate with this research work which showed that fish meal can be substituted completely (100%) by Blood meal with no adverse effect on growth, survival and feed conversion ratio in C. gariepinus. D1and D5 gave the highest growth rate of 4.52±2.51, 4.71±2.51which was significantly different from D2, D3 and D4 (3.92±2.51), (2.85±2.51, 2.87±2.51).D2 and D3 gave the highest F.C.R (1.81±0.38, 1.16±0.38) which were significantly different from D1, D4 and D5 $(1.57 \pm 0.38),$ $(0.70\pm0.38),$ (1.13±0.38). Good performance of Blood meal based diet in the present experiment does not agree with the study by Otubusin (2009) in which the feed containing the highest amount of blood meal gave the poorest performance in terms of growth and F.C.R. Abery, Gunasekera and De-Silva, (2002); Agbebi et al., (2009) and Bekibele et al., (2013) reported that optimum bone meal with blood meal could effectively replace up to 75% of fish meal in the diet fed to Oreochromis mossambicus fry. Other possible explanation for the low performance at increasing levels of fish meal substitution by Blood meal may be the resulting effect on diet digestibility. Several authors have mentioned that poor growth and feed

Duwal, et al., ADSUJSR, 7(1):1-7, April, 2019

utilization of fish fed feeds containing alternatives of fish meal for example spray-dried Blood meal, may be due to low protein digestibility and essential amino acid deficiency (mainly due to deficient processing of rendered meals), (Bureau et al., 1999; Martínez-Llorens et al., 2008). Millamena (2002) has shown that apparent digestibility values of Blood meal were generally lower than for fish meals for Epinephelus coioides. D1 gave the highest survival rate of (81.67±10.6) which was significantly different from D2, D3 and D4, D5 (68.33±10.6), (55.00±10.6, 58.33±10.6) and (75.00±10.6). However, this high survival rate contradicts with the findings of Eyo and Olatunde (1999) where fish fed the highest levels of blood meal recorded the highest mortality in the cages. In the present experiment, it was clear that inclusion levels of blood meal had no effect on the survival rate of C. gariepinus. Aladetohun and Sogbesan (2013) also recorded no mortality and concluded that Blood meal can perform very well as a feedstuff at inclusion rate of 100% and can replace fishmeal in Tilapia diet with no adverse effect on growth and survival of O. niloticus fingerlings. The growth performance and feed utilization efficiency of C. gariepinus fingerlings were also affected by the water quality parameters including water temperature, pH, dissolved oxygen, and Ammonia. However, the average values of all water quality parameters recorded during the experiment were within a suitable range for the normal growth of Cgariepinus fingerlings. pH ranged from 8.78±0.07 to 8.23±0.07, temperature from 18.50±3.41 to 16.13±3.41, dissolved Oxygen from 6.03±0.04 to 5.53±0.04 and Ammonia from 0.17±0.08 to 0.16±0.08. The cost benefit analysis showed that D1 was the cheapest (N95.00)/kg while D5 the most expensive (N169.00)/kg. Aladetohun and Sogbesan (2013) also recorded the diet with high inclusion level of blood meal as the cheapest (¥3.9325)/kg while the other diet with high level of inclusion of fish meal as the most expensive (N23.5925)/kg. This study has therefore demonstrated that fish meal protein can be replaced by processed animal byproduct meals (Blood meal) up to 100%. The other inclusion levels gave a reduced growth rates than those exhibited by the control groups. It was therefore concluded that the utilization of Blood meal as a protein supplement in feeding C. gariepinus fingerlings will not only reduce the cost of production of the fish feed, but it will also alleviate the problem of environmental pollution and disposal of blood in the abattoirs. It was therefore concluded that, Blood meal can either completely or partially replace fish meal in the diet of *C. gariepinus* fingerlings. Hence it is recommended that fish breeders should go onto the use of processed Blood meal to reduce cost of production to maximize profit.

References

- Abery, N. W., Gunasekera, M. R., & De-Silva, S. S. (2002). Growth and nutrient utilization of Murray cod (*Maccullochellapeelii*) (Mitchell) fingerlings fed diets with levels of soybean and blood meal varying. *Aquaculture Research*, 33, 279-289. <u>http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1046/j.1355-</u> 557x.2002.00672.x
- Adikwu, I.A., (2003). A review of aquaculture nutrition in aquaculture development in Nigeria. Proceedings of the National Workshop on Fish Feed Development and Feeding Practices in Aquaculture, September 15-19, 2003, National Institute for Freshwater Fisheries Research, New Bussa, Nigeria, pp: 34-42.
- Agbebi OT, Otubusin SO, Ogunleye FO (2009). Effect of different levels of substitution of fish meal with blood meal in pelleted feeds on catfish *Clarias gariepinus* (Burchell, 1882) culture in net cages. *European Journal of Scientific Research*. 31(1):6-10.
- Aladetohun, N. F. and Sogbesan, O. A. (2013). Utilization of blood meal as a protein ingredient from animal waste product in the diet of Oreochromis niloticus. International Journal of Fisheries and Aquaculture, 5(9), 234-237.

http://dx.doi.org/10.5897/IJFA10.031

- Antolović N., Kožul V., Antolović M., Bolotin J., 2012) Effects of partial replacement of fish meal by soybean meal on growth of juvenile saddled bream (Sparidae). *Turkish Journal* of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 12:247-252.
- Barnes M. E., Brown M. L., Rosentrater K. A., Sewell J. R., (2012) An initial investigation replacing fish meal with a commercial fermented soybean meal product in the

Duwal, et al., ADSUJSR, 7(1):1-7, April, 2019

dietsof juvenile rainbow trout. *Open Journal* of Animal Sciences 2:234-243.

- Bayraktar K .and Bayır A., (2012) The effect of the replacement of fish oil with animal fats on the growth performance, survival and fatty acid profile of rainbow trout juveniles, *Oncorhynchus mykiss. Turkish Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences* 12:661-666.
- Bekibele, D. O., Ansa, E. J., Agokei, E. O., Opara, J. Y., Alozie-chidi, V. C. Arango, A. A. and Ibemere, I. (2013). The comparative effect of fish and blood meal based diets on growth and survival of juvenile tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) in concrete tank. *Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Science*, 8(1), 184-189 http:// dx.doi.org /10.3923/jfas. 2013.184.189
- Bureau, D. P., Harris, A. M., & Cho, C. Y. (1999).
 Apparent digestibility of rendered animal protein ingredients for rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). Aquaculture, 180, 345-358. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0044-848</u> 6(99)00210-0
- Burel, C. ; Boujard, T. ; Tulli, F. ; Kaushik, S. J., (2000). Digestibility of extruded peas, extruded lupin, and rapeseed meal in rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) and turbot (*Psetta maxima*). Aquaculture, 188 (3-4): 285-298
- Dominy MG, Ako H (1988). The utilization of blood meal as a protein ingredient in the diet of the marine shrimp *P. vannamei. Aquaculture* 70:289-299.

Dongmo, L.; Ndo, D.; Atchou, G. & Njamnshi, A.

(2000). Epilepsie au Sud-Cameroun:

enquête préliminaire dans le village Bilomo. Bulletin de la Société de Pathologie

Exotique, Vol.93, No.3 :263-275, ISSN 0037-9085.

- Duwal,S.D.(2016) Hatchability, Survival and Growth Performance of Cold Shocked *Clarias* gariepinus Fingerlings from Mubi, Nigeria. Adamawa State University Journal of Agricultural Sciences, 4:1.71-75
- Eyo, A. A. and Olatunde, A. A. (1999). The effect of replacement of soyabean meal with blood meal on the growth of mudfish Clarias anguillaris (L.) fingerlings (pp. 232-240). 13th Annual Conference of the Fisheries

Society of Nigeria (FISON), November 3-8, 1996, New Bussa, Nigeria. Retrieved from http://aquaticcommons.org/3861/1/13P232.p df

- FAO,(2010). Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations World
 - Review of Fisheries and Aquaculture 2010. Available at: http://www.fao.org/docrep/013/i1820e/i1820e01.pdf. Accessed June 15, 2012. Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations
- FAO,(2012).On the state of the world fisheries and aquaculture part I:
- Falaye, AE (1992). Utilisation of Agro-Industrial Wastes as Fish Feedstuffs in

Nigeria. Proceeding of the 10th Annual Conference of FISON, pp 47-57

- Lunger A. N., McLean E and Craig S. R.(2007) The effects of organic protein supplementation upon growth, feed conversion and texture quality parameters in juvenile cobia (*Rachycentron canadum*). Aquaculture 264:342–352.
- Martínez-Llorens S., Tomás Vidal A., Moñino A. V., Ader J. G., Torres M. P., Cerda M. J., 2008 Blood and haemoglobin meal as protein

sources in diets for gilthead sea bream (*Sparus aurata*): effects on growth, nutritive efficiency and fillet sensory differences. *Aquaculture Research* 39:1028–1037.

- Millamena O. M., (2002). Replacement of fish meal by animal by-product mealsin a practical diet for grow-out culture of grouper *Epinephelus coioides. Aquaculture* 204:75-84.
- Otubusin, S. O., Ogunleye, F. O.and Agbebi, O. T. (2009). Feeding trials using local protein sources to replace fishmeal in pelleted feeds in Cat fish (*Clariasgariepinus* Burchell 1822) Culture. *European Journal of Science Research*, 31(1), 142-147
- Sauvant, D.(2004).Tables of Composition and Nutritional Value of Feed Materials:
- Tingman, W., Jian, Z. and Xiaoshuan, Z. (2010). Fish product quality evaluation based on temperature monitoring in cold chain. *African Journal of Biotechnology* 9: 6146-6151
- Zhou Q. C., Tan B. P., Mai K. S.and Liu Y. J.(2004) Apparent digestibility of Selected feeding ingredients for juvenile cobia *Rachycentron canadum*. *Aquaculture* 241:441–451.